

1 Honorable Richard A. Jones  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6

7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
8 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
9 AT SEATTLE

10 PHYTELLIGENCE, INC.,

11 Plaintiff,

12 v.

13 WASHINGTON STATE UNIVERSITY,

14 Defendant.

15 NO. 2:18-cv-00405-RAJ

16 PHYTELLIGENCE'S MOTION FOR  
17 REMAND AND REQUEST FOR  
18 ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS

19 **Noted for Consideration, Friday,  
20 April 13, 2018**

21 Plaintiff, Phytelligence, Inc. ("Phytelligence"), seeks an order remanding this matter to  
22 the Superior Court for King County. Phytelligence is the plaintiff and therefore the "master of  
23 the complaint" and its pleadings definitely do not raise a federal question. Consequently,  
24 subject matter jurisdiction does not exist in this Court and it should be remanded under 28  
25 U.S.C. § 1447(c). Because WSU lacks an objectively reasonable basis for removal in the first  
instance and failed to stipulate to remand upon request by Phytelligence's, the Court should  
award Phytelligence its attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of the removal.

26 **I. STATEMENT OF RELEVANT FACTS**

27 This lawsuit arises out of a dispute between Phytelligence and WSU regarding a  
28 contract entered between the parties which allowed Phytelligence to propagate and eventually  
29 distribute plants of a new apple cultivar originally nominated "WA 38." The Agreement to  
30 Propagate Apple Cultivar Plant Materials for Washington State University, effective November  
31

32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
2510  
2511  
2512  
2513  
2514  
2515  
2516  
2517  
2518  
2519  
2520  
2521  
2522  
2523  
2524  
2525  
2526  
2527  
2528  
2529  
2530  
2531  
2532  
2533  
2534  
2535  
2536  
2537  
2538  
2539  
2540  
2541  
2542  
2543  
2544  
2545  
2546  
2547  
2548  
2549  
2550  
2551  
2552  
2553  
2554  
2555  
2556  
2557  
2558  
2559  
25510  
25511  
25512  
25513  
25514  
25515  
25516  
25517  
25518  
25519  
25520  
25521  
25522  
25523  
25524  
25525  
25526  
25527  
25528  
25529  
25530  
25531  
25532  
25533  
25534  
25535  
25536  
25537  
25538  
25539  
25540  
25541  
25542  
25543  
25544  
25545  
25546  
25547  
25548  
25549  
25550  
25551  
25552  
25553  
25554  
25555  
25556  
25557  
25558  
25559  
25560  
25561  
25562  
25563  
25564  
25565  
25566  
25567  
25568  
25569  
25570  
25571  
25572  
25573  
25574  
25575  
25576  
25577  
25578  
25579  
25580  
25581  
25582  
25583  
25584  
25585  
25586  
25587  
25588  
25589  
25590  
25591  
25592  
25593  
25594  
25595  
25596  
25597  
25598  
25599  
255100  
255101  
255102  
255103  
255104  
255105  
255106  
255107  
255108  
255109  
255110  
255111  
255112  
255113  
255114  
255115  
255116  
255117  
255118  
255119  
255120  
255121  
255122  
255123  
255124  
255125  
255126  
255127  
255128  
255129  
255130  
255131  
255132  
255133  
255134  
255135  
255136  
255137  
255138  
255139  
255140  
255141  
255142  
255143  
255144  
255145  
255146  
255147  
255148  
255149  
255150  
255151  
255152  
255153  
255154  
255155  
255156  
255157  
255158  
255159  
255160  
255161  
255162  
255163  
255164  
255165  
255166  
255167  
255168  
255169  
255170  
255171  
255172  
255173  
255174  
255175  
255176  
255177  
255178  
255179  
255180  
255181  
255182  
255183  
255184  
255185  
255186  
255187  
255188  
255189  
255190  
255191  
255192  
255193  
255194  
255195  
255196  
255197  
255198  
255199  
255200  
255201  
255202  
255203  
255204  
255205  
255206  
255207  
255208  
255209  
255210  
255211  
255212  
255213  
255214  
255215  
255216  
255217  
255218  
255219  
255220  
255221  
255222  
255223  
255224  
255225  
255226  
255227  
255228  
255229  
255230  
255231  
255232  
255233  
255234  
255235  
255236  
255237  
255238  
255239  
255240  
255241  
255242  
255243  
255244  
255245  
255246  
255247  
255248  
255249  
255250  
255251  
255252  
255253  
255254  
255255  
255256  
255257  
255258  
255259  
255260  
255261  
255262  
255263  
255264  
255265  
255266  
255267  
255268  
255269  
255270  
255271  
255272  
255273  
255274  
255275  
255276  
255277  
255278  
255279  
255280  
255281  
255282  
255283  
255284  
255285  
255286  
255287  
255288  
255289  
255290  
255291  
255292  
255293  
255294  
255295  
255296  
255297  
255298  
255299  
255300  
255301  
255302  
255303  
255304  
255305  
255306  
255307  
255308  
255309  
255310  
255311  
255312  
255313  
255314  
255315  
255316  
255317  
255318  
255319  
255320  
255321  
255322  
255323  
255324  
255325  
255326  
255327  
255328  
255329  
255330  
255331  
255332  
255333  
255334  
255335  
255336  
255337  
255338  
255339  
255340  
255341  
255342  
255343  
255344  
255345  
255346  
255347  
255348  
255349  
255350  
255351  
255352  
255353  
255354  
255355  
255356  
255357  
255358  
255359  
255360  
255361  
255362  
255363  
255364  
255365  
255366  
255367  
255368  
255369  
255370  
255371  
255372  
255373  
255374  
255375  
255376  
255377  
255378  
255379  
255380  
255381  
255382  
255383  
255384  
255385  
255386  
255387  
255388  
255389  
255390  
255391  
255392  
255393  
255394  
255395  
255396  
255397  
255398  
255399  
255400  
255401  
255402  
255403  
255404  
255405  
255406  
255407  
255408  
255409  
255410  
255411  
255412  
255413  
255414  
255415  
255416  
255417  
255418  
255419  
255420  
255421  
255422  
255423  
255424  
255425  
255426  
255427  
255428  
255429  
255430  
255431  
255432  
255433  
255434  
255435  
255436  
255437  
255438  
255439  
255440  
255441  
255442  
255443  
255444  
255445  
255446  
255447  
255448  
255449  
255450  
255451  
255452  
255453  
255454  
255455  
255456  
255457  
255458  
255459  
255460  
255461  
255462  
255463  
255464  
255465  
255466  
255467  
255468  
255469  
255470  
255471  
255472  
255473  
255474  
255475  
255476  
255477  
255478  
255479  
255480  
255481  
255482  
255483  
255484  
255485  
255486  
255487  
255488  
255489  
255490  
255491  
255492  
255493  
255494  
255495  
255496  
255497  
255498  
255499  
255500  
255501  
255502  
255503  
255504  
255505  
255506  
255507  
255508  
255509  
255510  
255511  
255512  
255513  
255514  
255515  
255516  
255517  
255518  
255519  
255520  
255521  
255522  
255523  
255524  
255525  
255526  
255527  
255528  
255529  
255530  
255531  
255532  
255533  
255534  
255535  
255536  
255537  
255538  
255539  
255540  
255541  
255542  
255543  
255544  
255545  
255546  
255547  
255548  
255549  
255550  
255551  
255552  
255553  
255554  
255555  
255556  
255557  
255558  
255559  
255560  
255561  
255562  
255563  
255564  
255565  
255566  
255567  
255568  
255569  
255570  
255571  
255572  
255573  
255574  
255575  
255576  
255577  
255578  
255579  
255580  
255581  
255582  
255583  
255584  
255585  
255586  
255587  
255588  
255589  
255590  
255591  
255592  
255593  
255594  
255595  
255596  
255597  
255598  
255599  
2555100  
2555101  
2555102  
2555103  
2555104  
2555105  
2555106  
2555107  
2555108  
2555109  
2555110  
2555111  
2555112  
2555113  
2555114  
2555115  
2555116  
2555117  
2555118  
2555119  
2555120  
2555121  
2555122  
2555123  
2555124  
2555125  
2555126  
2555127  
2555128  
2555129  
2555130  
2555131  
2555132  
2555133  
2555134  
2555135  
2555136  
2555137  
2555138  
2555139  
2555140  
2555141  
2555142  
2555143  
2555144  
2555145  
2555146  
2555147  
2555148  
2555149  
2555150  
2555151  
2555152  
2555153  
2555154  
2555155  
2555156  
2555157  
2555158  
2555159  
2555160  
2555161  
2555162  
2555163  
2555164  
2555165  
2555166  
2555167  
2555168  
2555169  
2555170  
2555171  
2555172  
2555173  
2555174  
2555175  
2555176  
2555177  
2555178  
2555179  
2555180  
2555181  
2555182  
2555183  
2555184  
2555185  
2555186  
2555187  
2555188  
2555189  
2555190  
2555191  
2555192  
2555193  
2555194  
2555195  
2555196  
2555197  
2555198  
2555199  
2555200  
2555201  
2555202  
2555203  
2555204  
2555205  
2555206  
2555207  
2555208  
2555209  
2555210  
2555211  
2555212  
2555213  
2555214  
2555215  
2555216  
2555217  
2555218  
2555219  
2555220  
2555221  
2555222  
2555223  
2555224  
2555225  
2555226  
2555227  
2555228  
2555229  
2555230  
2555231  
2555232  
2555233  
2555234  
2555235  
2555236  
2555237  
2555238  
2555239  
2555240  
2555241  
2555242  
2555243  
2555244  
2555245  
2555246  
2555247  
2555248  
2555249  
2555250  
2555251  
2555252  
2555253  
2555254  
2555255  
2555256  
2555257  
2555258  
2555259  
2555260  
2555261  
2555262  
2555263  
2555264  
2555265  
2555266  
2555267  
2555268  
2555269  
2555270  
2555271  
2555272  
2555273  
2555274  
2555275  
2555276  
2555277  
2555278  
2555279  
2555280  
2555281  
2555282  
2555283  
2555284  
2555285  
2555286  
2555287  
2555288  
2555289  
2555290  
2555291  
2555292  
2555293  
2555294  
2555295  
2555296  
2555297  
2555298  
2555299  
2555300  
2555301  
2555302  
2555303  
2555304  
2555305  
2555306  
2555307  
2555308  
2555309  
2555310  
2555311  
2555312  
2555313  
2555314  
2555315  
2555316  
2555317  
2555318  
2555319  
2555320  
2555321  
2555322  
2555323  
2555324  
2555325  
2555326  
2555327  
2555328  
2555329  
2555330  
2555331  
2555332  
2555333  
2555334  
2555335  
2555336  
2555337  
2555338  
2555339  
2555340  
2555341  
2555342  
2555343  
2555344  
2555345  
2555346  
2555347  
2555348  
2555349  
2555350  
2555351  
2555352  
2555353  
2555354  
2555355  
2555356  
2555357  
2555358  
2555359  
2555360  
2555361  
2555362  
2555363  
2555364  
2555365  
2555366  
2555367  
2555368  
2555369  
2555370  
2555371  
2555372  
2555373  
2555374  
2555375  
2555376  
2555377  
2555378  
2555379  
2555380  
2555381  
2555382  
2555383  
2555384  
2555385  
2555386  
2555387  
2555388  
2555389  
2555390  
2555391  
2555392  
2555393  
2555394  
2555395  
2555396  
2555397  
2555398  
2555399  
2555400  
2555401  
2555402  
2555403  
2555404  
2555405  
2555406  
2555407  
2555408  
2555409  
2555410  
2555411  
2555412  
2555413  
2555414  
2555415  
2555416  
2555417  
2555418  
2555419  
2555420  
2555421  
2555422  
2555423  
2555424  
2555425  
2555426  
2555427  
2555428  
2555429  
2555430  
2555431  
2555432  
2555433  
2555434  
2555435  
2555436  
2555437  
2555438  
2555439  
2555440  
2555441  
2555442  
2555443  
2555444  
2555445  
2555446  
2555447  
2555448  
2555449  
2555450  
2555451  
2555452  
2555453  
2555454  
2555455  
2555456  
2555457  
2555458  
2555459  
2555460  
2555461  
2555462  
2555463  
2555464  
2555465  
2555466  
2555467  
2555468  
2555469  
2555470  
2555471  
2555472  
2555473  
2555474  
2555475  
2555476  
2555477  
2555478  
2555479  
2555480  
2555481  
2555482  
2555483  
2555484  
2555485  
2555486  
2555487  
2555488  
2555489  
2555490  
2555491  
2555492  
2555493  
2555494  
2555495  
2555496  
2555497  
2555498  
2555499  
2555500  
2555501  
2555502  
2555503  
2555504  
2555505  
2555506  
2555507  
2555508  
2555509  
2555510  
2555511  
2555512  
2555513  
2555514  
2555515  
2555516  
2555517  
2555518  
2555519  
2555520  
2555521  
2555522  
2555523  
2555524  
2555525  
2555526  
2555527  
2555528  
2555529  
2555530  
2555531  
2555532  
2555533  
2555534  
2555535  
2555536  
2555537  
2555538  
2555539  
2555540  
2555541  
2555542  
2555543  
2555544  
2555545  
2555546  
2555547  
2555548  
2555549  
2555550  
2555551  
2555552  
2555553  
2555554  
2555555  
2555556  
2555557  
2555558  
2555559  
2555560  
2555561  
2555562  
2555563  
2555564  
2555565  
2555566  
2555567  
2555568  
2555569  
2555570  
2555571  
2555572  
2555573  
2555574  
2555575  
2555576  
2555577  
2555578  
2555579  
2555580  
2555581  
2555582  
2555583  
2555584  
2555585  
2555586  
2555587  
2555588  
2555589  
2555590  
2555591  
2555592  
2555593  
2555594  
2555595  
2555596  
2555597  
2555598  
2555599  
25555100  
25555101

1 27, 2012 (the “Propagation Agreement”), permitted Phytellience to propagate a recently  
2 developed and patented variety of apple known by the mark “Cosmic Crisp” and granted to  
3 Phytellience an option to obtain a license and participate as a seller of Cosmic Crisp apple  
4 plants after having met two conditions precedent, both of which have been met by  
5 Phytellience. Dkt. 2-1. pp. 27-30.

6 Phytellience communicated with WSU that it intended to exercise its option to  
7 participate as a seller. Nonetheless, WSU stymied all attempts by Phytellience to obtain from  
8 WSU (or its agent) the license necessary to do so. Consequently, Phytellience filed suit in the  
9 Superior Court of King County alleging breach of contract and seeking declaratory relief under  
10 RCW 7.24 *et seq.* (“Complaint”). Both claims were state law claims arising out of allegations  
11 that WSU breached the Propagation Agreement as well as seeking specific performance of  
12 WSU’s obligation under the option agreement to provide a license for sale of plants of the  
13 Cosmic Crisp cultivar. *See Exhibit A* *sans* exhibits (filed February 26, 2018), hereto.

14 WSU, initially answered Phytellience’s complaint, on March 8, 2018, through an  
15 Answer and Counterclaim, alleging purely state law counterclaims. *See Ex. B* (WSU’s Answer  
16 and Counterclaim to Complaint). In fact, WSU’s state court pleading even asserted that,  
17 because the state court did not have subject matter jurisdiction to hear WSU’s patent  
18 infringement claim, it was filing a simultaneous separate proceeding in the United States  
19 District Court for the Western District of Washington, No. 2:18-cv-00361, also filed March 8,  
20 2018. *Id.* at p.4, ll: 25-27. That action, which contains the same claim for patent infringement,  
21 is currently pending before Judge Martinez. *See Ex. C* (WSU’s March 8<sup>th</sup> Complaint for Patent  
22 Infringement and Breach of Contract), hereto.

23 Inexplicably, WSU then amended its King County Superior Court Answer and  
24 Counterclaim on March 18, 2018, to now assert the previously unassertable, patent  
25 infringement claim, which was already pending before Judge Martinez 10 days earlier in (Case

No. 2:18-cv-00361). See Ex. D (WSU's March 18<sup>th</sup> Amended Answer and Counterclaim) at p. 11, ll. 7-24.

As soon as that was filed, the next day WSU improperly remove Phytelligence's state court breach of contract claim and related remedies to this Court, claiming that the newly filed patent infringement counterclaim as the basis for original jurisdiction in this court. *See E* (WSU's March 19<sup>th</sup> Notice of Removal). WSU specifically alleging therein that because "WSU—has asserted a claim for relief ...relating to patents ... [thus the state court action] may be removed to this Court pursuant to the provisions of 28 U.S.C. § 1454." *Id.* at p. 2, ll. 6-9.

## II. ARGUMENT

A. Phytelligence's Complaint in the King County Superior Court does not raise a federal question and therefore this case must be remanded

WSU’s Notice of Removal fails to assert that any of Phytelligence’s claims raise a federal question under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 or 1338, and in that respect it is correct. Unquestionably, Phytelligence raised only claims for breach of contract and declaratory judgment in the Complaint. Neither of these simple state law claims raises a federal question. *Caterpillar Inc. v. Williams*, 482 U.S. 386, 394, 107 S. Ct. 2425, 2431, 96 L. Ed. 2d 318 (1987) (holding that defenses based in federal preemption of simple breach of contract claims, which are state law claims cannot serve as a basis for removal to federal court). Thus, the critical question that must be answered in determining whether this lawsuit must be remanded to the Superior Court for King County is whether or not a defendant can create original jurisdiction in a federal district court through a counterclaim. The answer to this question has been definitely established as “No.”

The United States Supreme Court first considered this exact question in *Holmes Grp., Inc. v. Vornado Air Circulation Sys., Inc.*, 535 U.S. 826, 830, 122 S. Ct. 1889, 1893, 153 L. Ed. 2d 13 (2002). *Holmes* involved a request for declaratory judgment regarding a trade-dress

1 issue filed in federal district court, as well as a compulsory patent infringement counterclaim  
2 based in federal patent law, which was appealed to the Federal Circuit Court of Appeals based  
3 upon the argument that the case raised federal patent law questions arising under 28 U.S.C. §  
4 1338. *Id.* The Supreme Court granted certiorari to determine whether indeed a question of  
5 federal patent law had been raised by the pleadings that would establish jurisdiction for the  
6 appeal in the Federal Circuit. *Id.* at 829.

7       In its opinion, the Supreme Court first examined whether the plaintiff's declaratory  
8 judgment action raised a federal patent law question under the "well-pleaded complaint rule."  
9 By that rule, courts determine whether a federal question exists for purposes of Section 1331  
10 based upon what legal questions arise in the "plaintiff's statement of his own claim." *Id.* at  
11 830. After determining that the well-pleaded complaint rule also applied to determining  
12 whether a complaint raises a question of federal patent law for purposes of Section 1338, the  
13 Supreme Court determined that the complaint for declaratory judgment *did not* raise a federal  
14 patent law question. *Id.*

15       The Supreme Court then considered the argument that the well-pleaded complaint rule  
16 also applied to counterclaims in determining whether original jurisdiction lies in federal district  
17 court. The Supreme Court rejected that argument and ultimately determined that federal  
18 jurisdiction generally exists only when a federal question is raised on the face of the *plaintiff's*  
19 *complaint*, and that a counterclaim cannot serve to establish a basis for federal "arising under"  
20 jurisdiction. *Id.* at 831 ("It follows that a counterclaim -- which appears as part of the  
21 defendant's answer, not as part of the plaintiff's complaint -- cannot serve as the basis for  
22 'arising under' jurisdiction")(citations omitted). In reaching that decision, the high court  
23 reasoned that to permit otherwise would flout long standing principles that make the plaintiff  
24 the "master of the complaint" which permits the plaintiff to avoid making federal law claims in  
25 order to have the cause heard in state court. *Id.* at 831-32.

PHYTELLIGENCE'S MOTION FOR REMAND AND REQUEST  
FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS - 4

Williams, Kastner & Gibbs PLLC  
601 Union Street, Suite 4100  
Seattle, Washington 98101-2380  
(206) 628-6600

1       Although *Holmes* involves the issue of jurisdiction over an appeal by the Federal  
2 Circuit Court of Appeals, the Supreme Court reconfirmed its holding that original jurisdiction  
3 in federal courts cannot be established by a counterclaim in *Vaden v. Discover Bank*, 556 U.S.  
4 49, 61, 129 S. Ct. 1262, 1273, 173 L. Ed. 2d 206 (2009). Unlike *Holmes*, *Vaden* directly  
5 considered whether a counterclaim may serve as the federal question permitting removal of a  
6 case from state court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 1331. Thus, it is firmly established that a  
7 counterclaim does not “provide a key capable of opening a federal court’s door.” *Id.* at 66.

8       As a consequence of the Supreme Court’s clear holding that a counterclaim cannot  
9 serve as a basis to remove a state court action under 28 U.S.C. Sections 1331 or 1338, there is  
10 no basis by which this Court may exercise jurisdiction over the instant cause.

11      B. The lack of objective basis for removal by WSU supports that Phytelligence should be  
12 awarded its attorneys’ fees and costs incurred in pursuing remand to the King County  
Superior Court

13       Section 1447(c) of Title 28, United States Code, authorizes an award of attorney’s fees  
14 and costs in an order remanding a case to state court. Courts may award such fees and costs  
15 when the removing party lacked an objectively reasonable basis for seeking removal. Here,  
16 where the only theoretical basis for removal was based on the defendant’s counterclaim, and  
17 the Supreme Court (as well as the 9<sup>th</sup> Circuit in prior case law) has directly held that  
18 counterclaims cannot serve as the basis of a federal question upon which removal is based, no  
19 objectively reasonable basis for removal exists. *See, e.g., Am. Fast Freight, Inc. v. R & R Exp.,*  
20 *Inc.*, C12-1717RSM, 2013 WL 64771, at \*4 (W.D. Wash. Jan. 4, 2013) (Judge Martinez in  
21 awarding fees and costs in light of the clear lack of removability foreclosed by Supreme Court  
22 precedent held that “the firm principle established by the Supreme Court that under the well-  
23 pleaded complaint rule, a counterclaim does not ‘provide a key capable of opening a federal  
24 court’s door.’ Removal on the basis of defendants’ counterclaims was thus improper.”).  
25 Consequently, the Court should grant to Phytelligence its reasonable attorneys’ fees and

expenses incurred in seeking remand. On reply, Phytelligence will provide a supporting declaration with the costs of bringing this motion and the expected reply briefing.

### III. CONCLUSION

Because the only claim sounding in federal law raised in this lawsuit is the patent infringement counterclaim raised by WSU, it is unable to meet its burden to show that this Court has original jurisdiction to hear this lawsuit. Thus, the Court should remand this matter to the King County Superior Court and grant to Phytelligence its attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of WSU's improper removal.

DATED this 22<sup>nd</sup> day of March, 2018 at Seattle, WA.<sup>1</sup>

s/Daniel A. Brown<sup>2</sup>  
Daniel A. Brown, WSBA #22028  
WILLIAMS, KASTNER & GIBBS PLLC  
601 Union Street, Suite 4100  
Seattle, WA 98101-2380  
Telephone: (206) 628-6600  
Fax: (206) 628-6611  
[dbrown@williamskastner.com](mailto:dbrown@williamskastner.com)  
[dvelloth@williamskastner.com](mailto:dvelloth@williamskastner.com)  
[bfassburg@williamskastner.com](mailto:bfassburg@williamskastner.com)

Attorneys for Phytelligence, Inc.

<sup>1</sup> The above-attorney of record declares under penalty of perjury of the laws of the United States and Washington that the factual statements contained in footnote 2 are true and correct.

<sup>2</sup> Phytelligence, to the extent necessary when a court lacks jurisdiction over a matter, has conferred to the extent possible with counsel for defendant Washington State University (“WSU”) on this issue. Prior to filing this motion, authority was presented showing the impropriety of removal in the first instance and requesting contrary authority from WSU. Rather than providing its good faith basis for removal, defense counsel attempted to push further communications out, which would add an additional week before this motion could be ultimately heard by the Court. This would add additional issues on upcoming court deadlines which Phytelligence does not believe it should be forced to respond to when the Court clearly lacks jurisdiction in this matter. The back and forth communications between counsel were admittedly in writing and not in person, but the timing of the motion did not allow for an in-person meeting on short notice as counsel did not learn of this removal until Tuesday, March 20, 2018.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on March 22, 2018, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to all CM/ECF participants.

s/Daniel A. Brown  
Daniel A. Brown, WSBA #22028  
WILLIAMS, KASTNER & GIBBS PLLC  
601 Union Street, Suite 4100  
Seattle, WA 98101-2380  
Telephone: (206) 628-6600  
Fax: (206) 628-6611  
[dbrown@williamskastner.com](mailto:dbrown@williamskastner.com)

Attorneys for Phytelligence, Inc.

PHYTELLIGENCE'S MOTION FOR REMAND AND REQUEST  
FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS - 7

**Williams, Kastner & Gibbs PLLC**  
601 Union Street, Suite 4100  
Seattle, Washington 98101-2380  
(206) 628-6600